From Me to All Panelists 10:57 AM

https://massinc.org/research/empowering-cities-to-accelerate-equitable-growth/

From Jensen Denoyes to Everyone 11:10 AM

Jensen Denoyes of the City of Brockton is present. This Zoom meeting is very informative.

From Michelle Simoes to Everyone 11:12 AM

Michelle Simoes, MA PTAC is here as well.

From Maeve Duggan to Everyone 11:14 AM

Thank you everyone for joining! Feel free to enter your questions in the chat or the Q&A function.

From Paul Matthews to Everyone 11:14 AM

Thank you to MassINC, Ben, and all involved in such terrific efforts for our Gateway Cities! (Paul Matthews, from Worcester Regional Research Bureau)

From Me to Everyone 11:17 AM

Here's a link to the full report:

https://massinc.org/research/empowering-cities-to-accelerate-equitable-growth/

From Mary Waldron to Everyone 11:17 AM

Ben, MassInc, and sponsors of this event, thank you for your independent research and efforts. Mary Waldron, Executive Director Old Colony Planning Council.

From Paul Matthews to Everyone 11:20 AM

Absolutely true that small cities need funding and support for data transparency....

From Dawn Creighton to Everyone 11:21 AM

Thank you for this tremendous information.

From Samilys Rodriguez to Everyone 11:21 AM

Center for Women & Enterprise -. Samilys Rodriguez, Director Women's Business Center, Eastern MA (Hi Michelle! Hi Ben!)

Me to Samilys Rodriguez, All Panelists 11:22 AM

Great to see you! Thanks for joining us.

From Michelle Simoes to Everyone 11:22 AM

Hi Samilys! Hope all is well with you!

Me to Mary Waldron, All Panelists 11:23 AM

Good morning Mary. Thanks for joining us. We should catch up on the digital equity work soon.

Me to Paul Matthews, All Panelists 11:24 AM

Good morning, Paul. Glad you could join us for this one. Excited to see where Worcester takes their work once the UMDI study is out.

From Tara Thompson to Everyone 11:24 AM

Is there any legislation work being done to try to eliminate the lowest and responsive bidder requirement and consider diversity, equity, inclusion?

From Maeve Duggan to Everyone 11:26 AM

Great question! We'll answer this in the Q&A

Keep your questions coming, either here or in the Q&A function

From Dr Dolores C Calaf EdD to Everyone 11:28 AM

Is there a slide that shows a comparison in funding receives by Gateway city in the state of MA? I am in Lawrence and I have a feeling that it might be low in the chart... am I wrong? Dr Dolores C Calaf, EdD, Community Consulting Collaborative LLC and Hispanic Market Solutions

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 11:31 AM

Highlights from the report: Massachusetts law empowers municipalities to aggressively pursue supplier diversity when designing and building school facilities, and the Supplier Diversity Office tracks spending on these projects. Yet, the most recent data for, FY 2020, shows that just 1.4 percent of school building design and construction contracts went to MBEs.

Me to Dr Dolores C Calaf EdD, All Panelists 11:32 AM

Not a funding table, but see Table 2 on p. 12 of the report for a picture of designated MBEs by city.

From Dr Dolores C Calaf EdD to All Panelists 11:33 AM

Okay thanks

From Shonte Davidson to All Panelists 11:33 AM

who will be responsible for evaluating and enforcing the MBE/DBE spend

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 11:35 AM

Another highlight from the report: Lawrence, Lynn, New Bedford, Pittsfield, Springfield, and Worcester have significantly fewer MBEs relative to their shares of the state’s non-white population

From Maeve Duggan to Everyone 11:35 AM

Thanks for that question, Shonte. We'll answer it in the Q&A.

From Darcie Sosa to All Panelists 11:36 AM

Will a recording of this be available. I would like to share this with the Director of the Berkshire Black Economic Council. https://berkshirebec.org/

and Pittsfield, North Adams, and Great Barrington municipal leaders

From Shonte Davidson to All Panelists 11:36 AM

Also. Pre-revenue businesses have an impossible time accessing financing, do you have any resources you can share for this situation?

From Maeve Duggan to Everyone 11:37 AM

@Darcie, yes a recording will be made available on our website. We will also send an event recap to registrants. Thank you for your interest in sharing!

From Wylie Goodman to All Panelists 11:37 AM

Can you repeat the name of the report? Color of...

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 11:39 AM

Color of Wealth Report

Available here: https://www.bostonfed.org/publications/one-time-pubs/color-of-wealth.aspx

Insightful data point: Certification from the state’s Division of Capital Management and Maintenance (DCAMM) is required to participate in most public construction projects. At present, just 27 individual businesses with Minority Business Enterprise (MBE) designation have the requisite DCAMM certification. This amounts to less than 1 percent of the approximately 3,000 incorporated minority-owned construction businesses in Massachusetts. White-owned construction businesses are four times more likely to have DCAMM certification. The absence of a single DCAMM-certified MBE in the city of Worcester, the second-most populous city in New England, is particularly notable.

From Larry Dixon to All Panelists 11:40 AM

Great information on legislative opportunities to increase MBE purchasing. Another area to consider too is the need to target MBE procurement to those MBEs in the municipality where the project will take place—as opposed to the whole state. As it is larger MBEs in the eastern part of the state are in a better position. Smaller MBEs that are trying to get going in a municipality where construction project receive no preference, making it almost impossible for them to compete. This is something we experience in Western MA.

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 11:45 AM

As a reminder the report unveiled today is available here: https://massinc.org/research/empowering-cities-to-accelerate-equitable-growth/. Kudos to MassInc and Eastern Bank.

Diversity in school construction at the municipal level is particularly anemic. As the report shows: The most recent data for, FY 2020, shows that just 1.4 percent of school building design and construction contracts went to MBEs.

From Travis Watson to Everyone 11:46 AM

I always think about how racist it is that only Black and brown businesses need to "certify" their race - we don't make companies owned by white people certify that they are white.

From Julianne Goodfellow to All Panelists 11:47 AM

We’ve heard repeatedly that there’s a significant hurdle to certification, even for well capitalized MWOBs

From Katherine Martinez to All Panelists 11:47 AM

Agreed Travis- this is a huge part of removing barriers to equitable opportunities

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 11:47 AM

For an interesting and creative intervention, check out the MassPort model on page 22 of the report. “Along with its three traditional criteria–ability to execute the project, financial capability, and architectural design and functionality–Massport stated that 25 percent of the points would focus on diversity and inclusion.”

From Travis Watson to Everyone 11:48 AM

Thanks for your thoughts, Natalia.

From Tracy Sopchak to Everyone 11:48 AM

I just picked up a new client BECAUSE I went to the trouble of becoming a certified WBE.

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 11:49 AM

Thank you, Natalia, for raising the challenges businesses experience with certification. The process can be daunting and time-consuming. Businesses really need legal and technical support to go through the certification process.

Maeve Duggan to Katherine Martinez, All Panelists 11:49 AM

Katherine, you shared your comment only with Host and Panelists. For Travis to see it, please repaste and make sure the "to" field is “everyone". Otherwise I'm happy to forward it along

From JocCole Burton to All Panelists 11:49 AM

Restructing certification would increase participation by small companies. Thank you Natalia.

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 11:49 AM

Cities should provide free wrap-around certification assistance.

From Travis Watson to Everyone 11:50 AM

I'd love to see us move toward a model letting companies self-identify based on agreed-upon criteria. If a company lies about its race, then leverage a heavy fine or something.

From JocCole Burton to All Panelists 11:50 AM

Certification is the collection of paperwork as well as an investment of time.

From Aaron Vega to Everyone 11:51 AM

This exact question re local purchasing is being address in a local anchor collaboartive program we are working on in Western MA.

From Wylie Goodman to Everyone 11:51 AM

Exactly, how do you address abuse of the system -- I saw this happen in NYC contracting -- where a company puts forward a woman (the wife of an owner) or a BIPOC individual as a front and presents them as the owner, but in fact the real owner is white and/or male?

From JocCole Burton to All Panelists 11:51 AM

Very true Bill!

From Me to Everyone 11:51 AM

For businesses in public works, the largest category of municipal capital investment, certification has no value. Cities can't implement inclusive procurement policies.

Maeve Duggan to JocCole Burton, All Panelists 11:52 AM

JoJo, thank you for your comments. Right now, only Host and Panelists can see them. If you intend for everyone to see them, please make sure you have selected "everyone" in the “To" field

From Me to Everyone 11:53 AM

The constraints in state law also lessen the value proposition of a disparity study. Why spend $1m or more on consultants if your agencies can't implement inclusive procurement in public works even with study findings due to constraints imposed by state law.

From JocCole Burton to Everyone 11:54 AM

Restructuring certification would increase participation by small business companies. Thank you Natalia! ~JC Burton

From Catherine Ratte, PVPC to Everyone 11:54 AM

Why does a disparity study cost one million dollars?

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 11:54 AM

As we explain on page 23: “When asked, the Attorney General’s Office assures mu- nicipalities that unbundling large contracts in order to ad- vance inclusive procurement is not “bid splitting,” which is done for the purpose of evading bidding laws. However, there is no written policy to this effect, and procurement officers are understandably wary of running afoul of the law. “

From JocCole Burton to Everyone 11:55 AM

Certification is the collection of paperwork as well as an investment of time.

From Maeve Duggan to Everyone 11:56 AM

@Catherine Ratte, great question. We'll answer it in the Q&A

From Catherine Ratte, PVPC to Everyone 11:56 AM

Thank you

From Wylie Goodman to Everyone 11:57 AM

Has anyone looked at a mentoring model? Bringing more women and BIPOC folks into the system by asking well-established companies to show evidence of mentoring or diverse hiring in apprenticeships or positions of leadership so that people have a way into the system if they're newer?

From Catherine Tumber to Everyone 11:58 AM

Excellent panel. THANK YOU.

From Maeve Duggan to Everyone 11:58 AM

@Wylie, thank you for your question. We'll answer it in Q&A

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 11:58 AM

The state should affirmatively release guidance on the distinctions between unbundling large contracts vs. bid splitting. What's allowed. What's not. And the state should provide resources for municipalities to collect data and conduct their own disparities studies. This is all low hanging fruit -- and will have a tremendous impact.

From kathleen bitetti to Everyone 11:59 AM

It is key to have paid internships for high school and college students.

Me to MassINC Admin (Direct Message) 12:00 PM

Alum - Can I hop back in for q&A now?

From Samilys Rodriguez to Everyone 12:01 PM

Hi Daylana! We appreciate your leadership!

From MassINC Admin to Me (Direct Message) 12:01 PM

Yes, I'll have Carrie transition to Q&A and welcome you back

From Wylie Goodman to Everyone 12:01 PM

It would be great to get a list of best-practice companies / programs that could serve as models for us to introduce to our regional leaders.

From JocCole Burton to Everyone 12:03 PM

Inclusionary change will have the most impact when it is included in the procurement policy. Traditionally led companies are not too excited about partnering/mentoring where there is a shared fee or what might feel like the traditional company has an additional expense by teaching a smaller company the ropes.

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 12:03 PM

By the way, here's an example of a sheltered market program: https://www.boston.gov/sites/default/files/file/2021/12/Shelter-Market-Program-2021.pdf

From JocCole Burton to Everyone 12:05 PM

Ben, so true. Thank you for collecting the data. Prime contracting is critical! ~JC Burton

From Wylie Goodman to Everyone 12:05 PM

TY!

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 12:07 PM

Suggestions from LCR | BizGrow on race-neutral efforts: 1. Breaking down large prime contracts into smaller pieces that smaller companies can successfully compete for. This also has the advantage of increasing competition, thus resulting in better prices for the City. 2. Establishing small or local business programs that provide incentives and/or subcontracting requirements for all small or local businesses. Since M/WBEs are disproportionately small, a small or local business program will often increase M/WBE participation.

3. Requiring each city department to conduct a regular assessment of future needs for goods and services, and proactively communicating these future needs in outreach efforts to small businesses.

4. Enacting prompt payment programs, to ensure that prime contractors pay their subcontractors in a timely fashion. 5. Regular public reporting of M/WBE participation, disaggregated to reflect MBE and WBE participation separately, as a means for city officials, the M/WBE community, and the public to see where progress is being made and where more work needs to be done. 6. Performance measures for Department heads that include success at meeting M/WBE participation goals. 7. Eliminating unnecessary RFP/RFQ and other bid criteria to ensure that overly-stringent requirements do not unnecessarily inhibit competition and limit the ability of M/WBE firms to compete.

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 12:07 PM

8. Providing bonding assistance by playing a brokering role between M/WBEs and financial institutions and bonding companies to help secure a required loan or bond.20 9. Creating a publicly accessible dashboard and scorecard for transparency and accountability with respect to progress on M/WBEs.

10. Streamlining certification processes to ensure they are not cumbersome or inaccessible to small businesses.

From Tiffany Allecia M.Ed. to Everyone 12:08 PM

Thank you Ben for that comment. It truly feels like we are an afterthought and companies are just filling a quota. DEI seems to be a buzz word currently and the practicality of policies isn't truly comprehensive enough to handle the full depth of disparities that our small BIPOC businesses face. Their is a myriad of challenges that are preventing our businesses to "get in the game". Its truly a discouraging process and many business owners who wouldn't be in a room like this, can't muster the strength to get through all the confusion and red tape.

From Samilys Rodriguez to Everyone 12:13 PM

There's inherently more of an admin burden in public contracting for subs, and increases for primes. This is especially true during the procurement stage where searching for bids and preparation activities are time consuming and often carried by the small biz owner at risk of not being awarded. Small business owners are wearing many hats and working with small teams, spending significant time and resources is a calculated risk many aren't willing to take.

What kinds of consequences are there for noncompliance in the law? Does noncompliance affect future bid opportunities?

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 12:14 PM

Disparity studies are critical. Boston’s Disparity Study demonstrated that just 1.2% of the City’s $2.1 billion spent in municipal contracts over a 5 year period went to Black- and Latinx-owned businesses. The City spent less than half a percent on Black-owned businesses. According to the Disparity Study, the City could have easily awarded at least 3.6% of procurement dollars to Black-owned businesses. That is approximately 70million that could — and should — have gone to Black-owned businesses to help close the opportunity and wealth gaps in historically disadvantaged communities. When you realize that, you can take affirmative steps and create meaningful interventions.

From Tiffany Allecia M.Ed. to Everyone 12:15 PM

Exactly Samilys! The experience you described is representative of many minority businesses in Springfield, MA. And unfortunately some give up on the process entirely because of it.

From Sandy Dennis to Everyone 12:15 PM

Thank you for sharing your expertise on this subject matter, Sandy Dennis, CAN

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 12:16 PM

Sample disparity study: https://www.boston.gov/sites/default/files/file/2021/02/2020%20City%20of%20Boston%20Disparity%20Study%20Final%20Report\_1.pdf

From Catherine Ratte, PVPC to Everyone 12:16 PM

Can you send out the chat after the session? I can't seem to save it

From Tara Thompson to Everyone 12:17 PM

when will the sdo hub come out?

From JocCole Burton to Everyone 12:17 PM

Ivan, thanks for the list. There is a state funded Bonding program in circulation. It was created with BECMA and a partner chamber. We’d love to share it with this audience.

From Ivan Espinoza-Madrigal to Everyone 12:17 PM

👍🏾

From JocCole Burton to Everyone 12:18 PM

Bill, are these grants available for non profit organizations?

From Me to Everyone 12:19 PM

Thanks Bill. We really appreciate all of your leadership and support for this work.

From Samilys Rodriguez to Everyone 12:19 PM

CWE is a nonprofit, TA provider and SBA Partner we'd love to support Small, Minority, Woman, Veteran, LGBT Owned Businesses in the Commonwealth www.cweonline.org srodriguez@cweonline.org

From kathleen bitetti to All Panelists 12:21 PM

Will people's contact info be shared?

From Anne Kandilis to Everyone 12:21 PM

Western Mass represented! :)

From Kareem Kibodya to Everyone 12:21 PM

Thank you everyone for joining! Please feel free to connect at KKibodya@becma.org

From Andre Leroux to Everyone 12:21 PM

Thank you Senator for those kind words

From Natalia Urtubey to Everyone 12:22 PM

Please feel free to contact me at: n.urtubey@easternbank.com

From Andre Leroux to Everyone 12:22 PM

An Act to promote inclusive entrepreneurship and economic justice S.270/H.505

https://malegislature.gov/Bills/192/S270

From JocCole Burton to Everyone 12:22 PM

Senator Lessor, thank you for your leadership!

From Andre Leroux to Everyone 12:23 PM

House Ways and Means version of the economic development bill (H.5007), which could be voted on this week: https://malegislature.gov/Bills/192/H5007

From Bill. McAvoy to Everyone 12:26 PM

Feel free to contact me at Bill.McAvoy@mass.gov

From Sandy Dennis to Everyone 12:28 PM

Can you email me the link to access this recording? Sandy Dennis, Fall River DENDENLLC@COMCAST.NET

From Maeve Duggan to Everyone 12:29 PM

@Sandy, all registrants will receive a recap email with a link to the recording. Stay tuned!

From Sandy Dennis to Everyone 12:29 PM

Thanks~

From Christopher Sicuranza to Everyone 12:29 PM

Would be grateful for any follow-up docs, thanks from Chris Sicuranza in Haverhill Mayor's Office!

From kathleen bitetti to Everyone 12:32 PM

Thank you for a great panel- please be aware of the work the MA State Auditor has done in this space- in our audits and in our reports from the OSA Division of Local Mandates https://www.mass.gov/orgs/office-of-the-state-auditor

From Me to Everyone 12:32 PM

Thank you Dave. Really appreciate your help and leadership.

From Catherine Ratte, PVPC to Everyone 12:32 PM

Thank you all

From Cadrienne Turner to All Panelists 12:32 PM

Thank you!